To Accreditation Council of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care June 10, 2022

# REPORT

# OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF <u>THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME</u> <u>7R01144 - "SURGICAL DENTISTRY"</u> FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY RESIDENCY) IN MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION

# Non-State educational institution "KAZAKH-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"

period of external expert evaluation: 30.05.22-01.06.2022

Almaty, 2022

Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	List of symbols and abbreviations	3
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	5
2.	General part of the final report	7
2.1.	Presentation of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" and educational	9
	programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry"	
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	10
2.3.	Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the	10
	educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry" for compliance with the	
	Standards of accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty of residency) of	
	medical organizations of education and conclusions	
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	11
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	16
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an	17
	external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry"	
6.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme	34
	7R01144 - Surgical Dentistry	
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	35
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of external evaluation and educational	36
	programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry"	
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	37

2

# List of symbols and abbreviations

Abbreviation	Designation
RoK	Republic of Kazakhstan
ECTS	European netting system
PBL	Problem-oriented learning
TBL	Team-Based Learning
AIS	Automated Information System
BD	Basic disciplines (training)
EEC	External expert commission
University	Higher education institution
SAC	State Attestation Commission
ССН	City Clinical Hospital
CD&E	Civil defense and emergencies
SCES	State compulsory standard of education
CIDCH	Children's Infectious Disease Clinical Hospital
DSHR	Department of Science and Human Resources
DLT	Distance learning technologies
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher
	Education and Health Care
FSA	final state attestation
IPE	Institute of Postgraduate Education
IEP1	Individual Educational Plan
CC	Component of Choice
CMI	Control and measuring instruments
СЕР	Educational Programmes Committee
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
QEP	Quality of the educational process
NEI "KRMU"	Non-state educational institution "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"
MoH RoK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES of RoK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MJ of RoK	Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan
RWR	Research work of the resident
NLA	Normative legal acts
NCIE	National Centre for the Independent Examination
SC	Scientific Center
FLS	Fundamentals of life safety
EP	Educational programme
MT	Midterm
PD	Profiling disciplines (training)
РМНС	Primary Medical health care
TS	Teaching staff

SPE on the REM	State Public Enterprise on the Right of Economic Management
WC	Working Curricula
QMS	Quality Management System
SOP	Standard Operating Procedures
IWS	Independent work of residents
IWR	independent work of a residen
SC	Simulation Center
IWRT	Resident independent work under the supervision of a teacher
TEP	Typical Educational plan
RWR	Research work of the resident
EMA	Educational and methodological association
SC	Scientific Council
TCC	Training and Clinical Center
СССН	Central City Clinical Hospital
SPE	School of Pedagogical Excellence
ACC	Alumni Career Center

4

# 2. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 19 dated May 20, 2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme of the residence in th specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" in the period May 30-June 1, 2022, as follows:

order №	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Academic degree, academic title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	chairperson	Kurmanova Almagul Medeubaevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of clinical specialties of the Higher School of Medicine of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi, Leading Researcher, JSC Scientific Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology
2	Foreign Expert	Zakirova Guzel Zakirovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Ophthalmology of Kazan State Medical University, Ophthalmologist of the Children's Republican Clinical Hospital of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Tatarstan
3	Academic Expert	Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhayevna	doctor of Medical Sciences head of the Department of Family Medicine No.3 - "Medical University of Astana" NJSC;
4	Academic Expert	KAUYSHEVA ALMAGUL AMANGELDINOVNA	candidate of Medical Sciences, Vice-Rector for Educational and Scientific Activities Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH", Accredited independent expert on the assessment of the quality of medical services, Deputy Chairperson of the Board of the RPO "Kazakhstan Alliance of Medical Organizations"
5	Academic Expert	Sarsenbayeva Gulzhan Iskendirovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Doctor of the Department of Cardiac Surgery and Interventional Cardiology of the Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery JSC
6	Academic Expert	Bacheva Irina Viktorovna	PhD in Medicine, associate Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases, Head of the Residency Educational Programme in Nephrology, including Pediatric, NJSC Medical University of Karaganda
7	Academic Expert	Laryushina Elena Mikhailovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor, head of the Department of Internal Diseases

			NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"			
8	Academic	Sultanova Gulnar	candidate of Medical Sciences, Dean of th			
	Expert	Dosnovna	Faculties of Dentistry, Pharmacy, Public			
			Health Care and Nursing			
			NJSC "Western Kazakhstan Medical			
			University named after Marat Ospanov"			
9	Employers'	Nurgaliyev Nurlan	Director general of GammaLab Diagnostic			
	representative	Yermekbayevich	Laboratory LLP			
10	Resident	Maykenova Arailim	Resident of the first year of study in the			
	Representative	Muratkyzy	specialty "Gastroenterology (adult,			
			children's)" of NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh			
			National Medical University"			

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the ECAQA on further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

# 2. General part of the final report

# 2.1 Presentation of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" and educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-state educational institution "Kazakh- Russian Medical University", BIN 970240002300
Management body	Founders' Council
Full name of the chief executive officer	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich
Created in	1992
Location and contact details	Almaty, str. Abylai Khan 51/53 +7(771)495-60-51, +7(778) <u>188-54-48 info@medkrmu.kz</u>
State license for educational activities in the residency (date, number)	No.0137388 dated July 8, 2021
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no.
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2021
Duration of training	2 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	1

Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care

Number of residents on EP since the beginning of the current year	1
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	39 (84.6%)

The NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" (hereinafter – the University) was established in 1992 as the Kazakhstan Medical Institute (KMI). In 2010, KMI was renamed into Kazakh-Russian Medical University (certificate of state re-registration No. 9833-1910-U-e dated May 4, 2010).

NGO "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" is an educational institution that provides students with competitive higher and postgraduate medical education with a state diploma.

The University currently represents the organization of medical education with a private form of ownership, having the necessary material, technical and scientific and educational base, highly qualified pedagogical and scientific personnel (license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010). The University trains specialists in the following levels: bachelor's degree, internship, residency and master's degree on the basis of existing state licenses for higher and postgraduate levels, additional education in accordance with the current State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and also implements additional education programmes.

Over the years, the university has shaped its brand, traditions and values, continuing to follow the course to universities of the international level, indicated by the country's leadership. Since 2011, the University publishes a quarterly magazine "Actual problems of theoretical and clinical medicine". The university's budget is formed from several sources: the republican budget (a state order for the training of specialists of higher, postgraduate and additional education), the provision of paid educational services. The financing of the university is stable and contributes to improving the material and technical base and increasing the contingent.

The main applied scientific direction of the university is the development of innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population. Thus, for his achievements in the development of mobile medical complexes, Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor N.T. Dzhainakbayev was awarded the quality certificate of the Swiss Institute of Quality Standard "International Qualiti Sertificate" (SIQS) in 2015.

In order to develop cooperation, 30 agreements, agreements and memoranda with Kazakhstan and foreign higher educational institutions have been concluded.

Training of students is conducted in the state, Russian and English languages. Form of study – full-time, daytime. Over 29 years of activity, the University has trained more than 6,000 specialists successfully working in the practical health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In 2016, the University was accredited by the Independent Kazakhstan Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (certificate of institutional accreditation dated May 31, 2016. IANo.0066, valid from 31.05.2016 to 01.06.2021). Also in 2021, the University was accredited by the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" (certificate of international institutional accreditation dated June 17, 2021 IA00039, valid from June 17, 2021 to June 16, 2026).

Specialized accreditation passed 6 educational programmes of bachelor's degree, 13 educational programmes of residence in the Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency (IAAR) <u>http://www.iaar.kz/en/accreditation-en/perechen-akkreditovannykh-obrazovatelnykh-programm/respublika-kazakhstan/meditsinskie-organizatsii-obrazovaniya#</u> and 2 educational

programmes of master's <u>degree http://www.ecaqa.org/akkreditatsiya/reestr-akkreditovannykh-meditsinskikh-organizatsij-obrazovaniya-i-obrazovatelnykh-programm/spetsializirovannaya-akkreditatsiya/magistratura</u>

The NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" implements 35 educational programmes of the residency. Study in the residency in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" is carried out in full-time, the duration of study is 2 years. In 2021, the first enrollment for the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" was carried out in the amount of 1 student on a contractual basis.

# 2.2. Information on previous accreditation

To date, the accreditation of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01144 – "Surgical Dentistry" has not been carried out.

# 2.3 Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01144 – "Surgical Dentistry " of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University", for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions

The self-assessment report of the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" is presented on 123 pages and contains 13 annexes according to the relevant standards. The report on the specialized self-assessment shall be accompanied by a list of members of the working group on conducting self-assessment and preparation for accreditation, indicating the responsibility of each member of the internal commission, information on the person responsible for conducting self-assessment for compliance with the Standards for specialized accreditation of educational programmes of ECAQA and is available at: <a href="https://krmu.edu.kz/akkreditatsii-i-litsenzii/">https://krmu.edu.kz/akkreditatsii-i-litsenzii/</a>.

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the head of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" Nurlan Dzhainakbayev, MD, professor, who confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of members of the internal self-assessment commission with an indication of the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme.

The self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" of the NGOEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" was carried out on the basis of Order No. 26-02-50/1-n/k dated 01.07.2021 "On preparation for accreditation and organization of the process of self-assessment of educational programmes".

The report was reviewed by the accreditation expert Kurmanova A.M., the review noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account in the feedback process with the representative of the university and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report. All the standards provide real practice of the university for the training of residents in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry", taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2021, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university

and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering. The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

# 3. External expert evaluation assessment

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved on May 20, 2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Rector of KazRossmeduniversity (hereinafter – KRMU/University) Dzhainakbayev N.T.

Turmukhambetova A.A. Dates of the visit to the organization: 30-31.05.2022. The external assessment is aimed at validation of the data of the self-assessment report and verification of indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards. The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- $\checkmark$  interview with management and administrative staff 19 people in total;
- $\checkmark$  interviews with residents 14 people;
- $\checkmark$  interviews with 6 employers, 8 teachers and 8 graduates;
- $\checkmark$  questionnaires of teachers and residents respectively;
- ✓ studying the <u>website\_www.medkrmu.kz;</u>
- ✓ supervision of the resident's training: attending a practical lesson at the Central Military Dental Polyclinic of the Ministry of Defense (MoF) of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Almaty, str. Zhandosova, 53). Lesson topic: "Providing emergency medical care to patients diagnosed with acute purulent odontogenic periostitis".
- ✓ overview of resources: 2 practice/clinical engagement bases were visited, including the Central Military Dental Polyclinic of the Ministry of Defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Central City Clinical Hospital, where resident training is conducted with the participation of 12 teachers;
- ✓ study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 36 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

Table 1 -Information about the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

J	Job Title	Quantity
V	Vice-rector	3

Head of Department	8
Head of Library	1
Academic Secretary	1
Specialists of the Residence Department	2
chairperson of the committee of educational programmes (residency and	1
doctoral studies)	
secretary of the admission postgraduate commission	1
Employees of departments	2
Chairperson and Executive Secretary of the Local Ethics Commission	1
FACULTY	8
Residents,	14
Including a resident of the 1st year of study in the specialty "Surgical	
Dentistry"	1
Healthcare Practitioners	6
<ul> <li>Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work of the State Clinical</li> </ul>	
Hospital No.1	
<ul> <li>Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work of the State Clinical</li> </ul>	
Hospital on the Right of Economic Management "Almaty	
Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital"	
<ul> <li>Director of MC "Rakhat"</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Deputy Director of Surgery, CCCH</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Deputy Director for Strategic Development of the CCCH</li> </ul>	
– IE "Bukumbayeva"	
Residency graduates	8
Total	56

In the process of visiting the units of the University, accreditation experts noted the strengths of the organization of education in relation to the accredited educational programme, including: the University has units that are directly related to the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry", which can be noted as the best practice in education. The educational programme was developed on the basis of requests of graduates of the internship "Dentistry" and practical health care (vacancies of dental clinics in Almaty (more than 100 vacancies according to HeadHunter, "Market.kz, Jooble, Rabota.nur.kz, etc.), which demonstrates the work at the request of the labor market. Despite the existence of a residency in the accredited specialty for the first year, all educational and methodological documentation and resource base is available in full and meets the accreditation standards. When interviewing residents, teachers and employers, their participation in the development and evaluation of the educational programme, topics of elective classes, participation in collegial advisory bodies, etc. was clarified.

The main direction of the educational programme is "patient-oriented education" by providing them with wide access to patients in dental clinics and multidisciplinary clinics in Almaty, faculty having scientific achievements and higher medical qualifications, closely cooperating with practical healthcare. This conclusion was made when visiting departments at clinical bases, where experts conducted a resource survey. Experts have identified the compliance of clinics with the training programme, the availability of modern equipment for teachers and residents, and the compliance with the needs of students and practical health care. The clinic has a training room equipped with a multimedia unit and laptops for the theoretical part of the lesson and a sufficient number of thematic patients. On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" for Compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairperson Kurmanova A.M. held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the university, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC. At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

# 4. Results of the survey.

An observer from the ECAQA conducted an online survey on the resource in the period 25-01.06.2022 https://webanketa.com/.

**Results of the survey of residents:** the total number of respondents -12 (in 2022, \_\_\_\_\_ residents are trained in accredited specialties, including 1 in the specialty "Surgical dentistry")

This university will be recommended as an organization of education -75 % fully agree, partially -25 %. Fully agree 83.3% of respondents, 8.33% partially agree and 8.33% doubt that programme managers and faculty are aware of their learning challenges. Completely (83.3%), partially (8.3%) and doubt the answer (8.3%) with the conditions and equipment of the study rooms, university classrooms. According to 100% (full) office equipment is available for use on the basis of practice. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - fully agree 100%. Fully (100%) satisfied with the library collection and resources. All 100% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources. The organization of clinical training, according to 75% of respondents, fully satisfies them, but 25% - partially. Satisfied completely (91.67%) and partially (8.33%) with the methods of teaching. There is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.) – 100% fully agree. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills – completely agree 91.67%, partially 8.33%. According to 91.67% of residents, teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in classes, and according to 8.33% - sometimes. According to 100% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes. Fully satisfied that study in higher education 83.33%, partly 16.67% of respondents. The university allows you to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty, 91.67% are confident, 8.33% cannot give an answer, 0% would like to believe it, 0% began to doubt it. 100% are fully satisfied with the organization of teaching in the NEI KRMU. According to 75% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism for improving educational programmes, but 16.67% believe that it is not necessary to conduct and 8.33% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive -91.67% of residents, satisfactory – 8.33%.

**Conclusion:** Analysis of the resident survey showed that residents are satisfied with the organization of education as a whole, namely, learning conditions, access to equipment, time for practical training, sufficient number of patients for supervision, quality of class administration.

**Results of the survey of teachers of resident programmes:** the total number of teachers according to the list -14.

The total number of respondents was 14, including 7.14 per cent with experience of up to 5 years, 28.57 per cent with experience of up to 10 years and 64.29 per cent with experience of more than 10 years. 100% satisfied with the organization of the educational process. The university observes ethics and subordination completely agree 100%. Completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace 92.86% of respondents, partially - 7.14%. There is an opportunity for career growth and competence development for teachers in the organization - 100% fully agree. In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of research -100% completely agree. 92,86% of respondents are completely satisfied with work of personnel service, doubt with the answer -7,14%. The majority of those surveyed have undergone refresher training over the past 5 years. 100% fully agree that they can be implemented as professionals. Unfortunately, 42.86% did not answer the question of whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and republican events, they applied for payment of travel, business trips, registration fee -7.14%, for payment of registration fee -7.14%, and 35.71% did not apply with this to the management or relevant administrative employees of the university. 100% of respondents fully agree that students have free access to patients on the clinical bases of the university and to the resources of the practice bases. 42.86% know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 7.14% used them, 28.57% do not know and 21.43% of respondents are doubtful about their availability. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers -92,86%, sometimes -7.14% of the respondents. Students are taught using a variety of teaching methods, but more often work is done by analyzing situational tasks (88.06%), working in small groups (92.86%), lectures (50%), interactive learning (64.29%), performing abstracts (50%), performing projects, coursework (50%), practical classes in clinical skills at the training and clinical center (50%), oral analysis of the topic of classes (78.57%) oral surveys and analysis of the topic (64.29%), working in small groups (50%) also problem-oriented learning (57.14%), solving tests (71.43%), solving cases (42.86%), less often written completion of tasks (28.57%). Completely according to 92.86% that this questionnaire will be useful for the development of recommendations for improving the university and educational programmes of the residency, 7.14% partially agree with this.

**Conclusion:** The results of the survey as a whole demonstrate that more than half of teachers are satisfied with the organization of the educational process, compliance with ethics and subordination, labor organization, resources of the clinical base, teachers' competencies, and also indicate the existence of centralized management of educational programmes.

# 4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry"

# Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

# **Evidence of compliance:**

# **1.1 1.1 Mission statement and deliverables**

Mission of the educational programme 7R01144 –"Surgical dentistry": formation of competencies and personal qualities of competitive, creative and innovative thinking, able to realize their knowledge and skills of new generation specialists/<u>https://krmu.edu.kz/hirurgicheskaya-stomatologiya/</u>.

According to the mission, the educational programme is aimed at training competitive specialists in the field of surgical dentistry, able to meet the needs of society in the provision of surgical dental care, to apply and develop advanced innovative technologies in practice and science, to use the achievements of information and communication technologies, to improve public health. Thus, the mission statement reflects all the requirements for the training of a resident physician with a broad professional outlook, possessing all the necessary key competencies, capable of independently

developing and being useful to society. The mission of the educational programme is described in accordance with the available resources, opportunities in accordance with the requirements of the market (labor) with its own understanding of social responsibility, with a discussion of the mission and objectives of the educational programme at all levels of the advisory councils/commissions of the university with approval at the advisory council of the university in accordance with the law and the NLA, with the systematic collection, accumulation and analysis of information on the activities of the department, implementing the educational programme of the residency with an assessment of strengths and weaknesses (SWOT analysis) to determine the policy and direction of strategic and tactical plans.

The official website of the university www.medkrmu.kz is an open, publicly available source of information about the university, where objective up-to-date information on all types of activities of the organization of education is concentrated, allowing all interested parties to find the necessary operational information for themselves.

The briefing of the Mission is brought to the attention of the TS at the departmental meetings. From interviews with residents, it was established that students are notified at curatorial hours, meetings with deans, posted on the information stands of the university buildings, the official website of the university, as well as through information booklets. During the work of the EEC, an interview was held with the administration of the university and heads of structural units, meetings with graduates, residents and employers. All of them confirmed that they knew the mission and final results of the residency's educational programmes, and also took an active part in the formation of proposals for its formation.

Analysis of the compliance of the University's activities with the criteria of this Standard as a whole indicates the existence of a Development Strategy, the corresponding mission and vision in this organization. The university management conducts an analysis on target indicators of areas of activity, monitoring and measures to improve.

# 1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Educational programme 7R01144 - Surgical dentistry is based on the mission and taking into account the requirements of the State Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the professional standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Dental activity" (Appendix No.1 to the Order of the Deputy Chairperson of the Board of the NCE "Atameken" No.285 dated 22.10.2018).

The competence-oriented educational programme allows to train a dental surgeon capable of the following types of professional activities: medical; organizational and managerial; research.

Clinical bases are selected in accordance with the mission of the University and the educational programme. The main clinical bases are multidisciplinary hospitals and dental clinics in Almaty and the region, equipped at the modern level, which was noted during the visual assessment of the clinical bases during the online visit of the EEC. The quality of training of specialists and their professional competencies is confirmed by the characteristics and feedback from the heads of medical organizations. Among the main advantages of graduates, employers noted the developed communicative qualities of young professionals (establishing contacts in the team, a culture of communication and the ability to build contacts with consumers of services - rated by employers at 91.5%) (Google Docs). After obtaining the certificate, the graduate has the opportunity to be employed in medical institutions for the position of a dental surgeon, apply for administrative positions in health care institutions, or continue studying in a master's and doctoral degree.

#### **1.3 Learning outcomes**

In the process of external evaluation, it was found that the educational programme is aimed at the formation of professional competencies on the basis of a competence-based approach to training. The competencies that the resident must master upon completion of training in the specialty 7R01144 –"Surgical Dentistry" are defined in the "Graduate Qualification Characteristics" in accordance with the Dublin Descriptors, the State Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the professional standard

of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Dental Activity". In order to properly implement the mission and goals of the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry", the available material resources are used responsibly. EEC members note that great importance is attached to the formation of appropriate behavior in students in relation to colleagues, patients and their relatives.

# **1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results**

The University implements the mission of the educational programme in the interests of the individual, society and the state, therefore, understanding the current and future needs of all stakeholders, strives to fulfill their requirements and wishes, constantly working for improvement. The success of the implementation of the residency educational programme is determined and carried out in close cooperation with the university's stakeholders. The interested parties in the implementation of the educational programme are residents, graduates of the residency, university employees, health authorities, healthcare organizations, employers of all forms of ownership, professional associations, the public. The educational programme is focused on the expectation of the employer and the needs of the labor market. During the meeting with employers, it was established that the university together with them discusses the educational programme in terms of choosing mandatory profiling disciplines and forming electives.

Residents participate in the evaluation of the educational programme by expressing their opinions and wishes at the end of the course of study or mastering a specific discipline in the questionnaire. Employers, members of professional associations are involved in the review of the educational programme, participation in the discussion of the results at meetings of the CEP, scientific and practical meetings of the University. For example, one of the reviewers of the accredited educational programme is the head of the Department of Maxillofacial Surgery of the Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital, Candidate of Medical Sciences Iskakov M.Sh.



Figure 1.1 – Visit to the clinical base of the educational programme

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 17 standards: full – 17. Standard 1: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

# Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME Evidence of compliance:

# 2 1 De stand de standere en service en servi

# 2.1 Postgraduate programme framework

According to the order of the Acting Minister of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2015 No.647 "On approval of state mandatory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties" (with amendments approved by the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-12/2020), the training of specialists in the residency includes: theoretical and clinical training, intermediate and final certification. Theoretical training includes the study of cycles of profile disciplines in the volume of academic hours (credits) 4080/136, mandatory

Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care

component (MC): 3960/132; optional component (CC) 120/4. The structural unit responsible for the development of the educational programme is the CEP of postgraduate education. The Committee includes experienced methodologists from among the leading professors, associate professors, teachers in the relevant educational areas, representatives of students and practical health care.

Educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" is developed in accordance with the State Standard State Standard for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties 2020, standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties, the National Qualifications Framework, the industry qualifications framework and professional standards, agreed with the Dublin Descriptors and the European Qualifications Framework.

The structure of the educational programme includes: purpose, tasks, passport of the educational programme, brief description and qualification requirements for the graduate. Internal regulatory documents regulating the process of development and implementation of the educational programme: Academic Policy R-01-17-14 dated 27.08.2021, Regulation on the Commission for ensuring the academic quality of the educational programme PL-03-36-08 dated 26.08.2021, Regulation on the current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students PL-03-35-11 dated 29.08.2019, Rules for the use of the "Anti plagiarism university" system PR-03-17-10 dated 29.08.2019, etc. (<u>Google Docs</u>). The TEP include a list of mandatory disciplines indicating the number of hours and disciplines of the elective component. The advantage of electives is the ability, if necessary, to deepen, supplement, adjust the main compulsory disciplines. The catalog of elective disciplines (CED) in the specialty 7R01144 –"Surgical dentistry" includes disciplines that allow to strengthen the achievement of the expected final results: "Clinical pharmacology in the practice of a dentist-surgeon", "Surgery of inflammatory diseases of the maxillofacial region", "Management of scientific research" and "Evidence-based medicine".

In accordance with the model training programmes, WC and working training programmes have been developed. Based on the results of the studied documents provided as annexes to the text of the self-report and the results of the interviews, it should be noted that certain stakeholders (students, employers, representatives of the Kazakhstan Dental Association, etc.) are involved in the development of the mission and educational programme. It also happens when the educational programme is updated. The content of the programmes of all disciplines takes into account regional and national features, the current state of medical science and practice, the main requirements of the Professional Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Dental activities" (2018). Training of residents is carried out taking into account the principles of continuity of basic medical education. Successful mastery by students of the final results of study in internship are decisive for the subsequent achievement of the final results of programme.

# 2.2 Scientific method

The use of traditional and innovative methods of teaching and learning in the educational process of the university allows students to develop cognitive skills (the ability to analyze, critically analyze the information received, the ability to adapt the acquired knowledge to real practice, the integration and application of the acquired knowledge), the ability to independently solve problems, to instill a constant need for lifelong learning. Each discipline of the educational programme 7R01144 – "Surgical Dentistry" includes training from the standpoint of evidence-based medicine, management of scientific research and teaches the search for reliable and high-quality information. In this they are assisted by teachers and mentors who have been trained in the Winter and Summer Schools for advanced training. The university pays great attention to the research work of faculty and students, who have the opportunity to conduct joint research, the results of which are presented at scientific conferences, publications. For the successful implementation of research, the educational programme includes disciplines: evidence-based medicine and management of scientific research as elective disciplines. They are necessary for an in-depth study of research standards, the organization of

research, evidence-based medicine, information technology, data processing and analysis, and the publication of results.

Based on the results of the analysis of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme, the Department of Surgical and Orthopaedic Dentistry, it is recommended to strengthen the research activity of the resident, maximizing participation in joint publications, making reports at scientific conferences.

# 2.3 Content of the residency programme

Educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" is developed in accordance with the State Standard State Standard for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties 2020, standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties, the National Qualifications Framework, the industry qualifications framework and professional standards, agreed with the Dublin Descriptors and the European Qualifications Framework. In the formation of the educational programme, the following factors were taken into account: the contribution of each discipline to the formation of competencies at a certain level (course), i.e. the responsibility of both specialized and related disciplines for the formation of a competent graduate, the definition of competencies in each discipline. In order to form the necessary competencies of residents, the residency programme is designed in such a way as to harmoniously integrate theoretical and practical components. The practical training course is based on practical work in dental clinics and basic units of multidisciplinary clinical hospitals. The obligatory components of the practical training of a specialist are work with patients, supervision of patients in accordance with the curriculum and programme. According to the educational programme, clinical bases are defined, the list and profile of which ensures the mastery of all clinical nosologies. The activities of clinical bases are regulated by both external and internal regulations on clinical bases.

Training in the specialty 7R01144 – "Surgical Dentistry" is carried out in person, the training period is 2 years. In accordance with the Classifier of specialties, the specialty is legitimate, and the graduate will receive a corresponding document on the specialty at the end of the educational programme. Persons who have completed training and successfully passed the final certification are awarded the qualification "doctor – dentist-surgeon" and a certificate of completion of residency is issued.

The EP of the residence meets the international requirements and the 7th level of the national framework of qualifications in medical education and the Structure of qualifications in the European Higher Education Area.

# 2.4 Programme structure, content and duration

The educational programme provides the necessary level of training of the resident and includes the relevant specialized disciplines. The structure of the programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry"is formed from various types of educational, scientific, clinical work and practice that determine the content of education, reflects their ratio, measurement and accounting. The programme of study of the specialty consists of 4200 hours (140 credits), of which independent clinical work under the guidance of a clinical mentor in the amount of 3060 hours and independent work of a resident – 612 hours and includes the following disciplines:

- $\checkmark$  local anesthesia in case of surgical interventions in the oral cavity 15 credits;
- ✓ purulent oral surgery -41 credits;
- ✓ restorative oral surgery -35 credits;
- ✓ dental implantation -41 credits.

From 140 credits of the educational programme: profiling disciplines -132 credits, a component of choice -4 credits, interim certification-2 credits, final certification -2 credits.

The academic year consists of 45 weeks, which is 2,100 hours and includes theoretical, clinical training and holidays, lasting 6 weeks between academic years. Final assessment lasting 2 weeks. The academic week consists of 54 hours, 1/3 of which is independent work of the resident in

extracurricular time, which is sufficient to form the planned competencies and achieve the final results.

The curriculum of the programme provides a sequence of study of disciplines based on their continuity, rational distribution of disciplines by semesters from the standpoint of uniformity of the academic work of the resident. The implementation of the educational programme in the specialty is carried out with the participation of all departments and clinical bases of the University. The management of the university and teachers are responsible for the high-quality preparation of the educational programme and the allocation of resources necessary for its implementation.

There are reviews for the educational programme 7R01144 – "Surgical Dentistry", drawn up by the Director of the Higher Medical and Dental College, Professor N.S. Ruzuddinov, as well as the Head of the Department of Maxillofacial Surgery of the Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital, Candidate of Medical Sciences Iskakov M.Sh.

#### 2.5 Organization of training

The training is based on practice, involving the students of the Residency in personal participation in the provision of medical services and responsibility for patient care activities in medical organizations recognized as the bases of the Residency. The requirements of the educational programme are direct work in the clinic with patients, starting from the 1st year of study. Different levels of clinical skills are structured according to the specific stage of the training programme and the corresponding level of clinical base, depending on the degree of complexity of medical care. As training progresses, the level of responsibility gradually increases so that they are ready to conduct independent clinical activities after completing their training. Training of resident angiosurgeons is carried out at the Center with personal participation in the therapeutic and diagnostic process, both in class time and during independent work.

In order to create conditions and means for the personal participation of residents in the provision of medical care at the level of PMHC and hospital, departments are provided with clinical bases. Practical training is carried out through the daily personal participation of a young specialist in medical activities using methods of diagnosis and treatment based on evidence-based medicine, the acquisition of practical skills provided for in the curriculum, and work to promote a healthy lifestyle. Thus, due to the possibility of working in clinics and independently doing medical work, residents have increased responsibility to the patient and colleagues.

To improve the educational process, various teaching methods used to achieve the final result of education are used in the educational process. Innovative teaching methods, which are practiceoriented, are being actively introduced. The average duration of the resident's daily work is 9 academic hours. Practical part of education occupies 90% of training. Different methods of training residents are used.

Students are taught using a variety of teaching methods, but more often work is done by analyzing situational tasks (88.06%), working in small groups (92.86%), lectures (50%), interactive learning (64.29%), performing abstracts (50%), performing projects, coursework (50%), practical classes in clinical skills at the training and clinical center (50%), oral analysis of the topic of classes (78.57%) oral surveys and analysis of the topic (64.29%), working in small groups (50%)also problem-oriented learning (57.14%), solving tests (71.43%), solving cases (42.86%), less often written completion of tasks (28.57%).

When working with residents, training is carried out using updated protocols, treatment recommendations, own and borrowed implementations in clinical practice. During the visit to the practical lesson on the topic "Emergency medical care for patients diagnosed with acute purulent odontogenic periostitis", the experts found that the resident was provided with a syllabus in the discipline, which he actively used. The resident has a diary-report, which displays an individual curriculum, a report on duty and evaluation sheets, a list of practical skills and manipulations on the nosology of diseases that need to be mastered, and a record of supervised patients.

Experts drew attention to the high equipment of the clinical base, which really allows to effectively implement in the educational process such as the analysis of clinical cases, the maintenance of medical records, examination of the quality of medical care, patient management, training in a clinic with the participation of a real patient, training in primary health care, attendance at medical conferences, Concilium. During the interview with the teacher A.Zh. Sarsenov, the experts noted that there is a sufficient number of thematic patients in the outpatient clinic for residents to carry out an outpatient surgical dental appointment.



When interviewing the resident in the study room, it was found that at the end of the year, he fully mastered and completed practical skills in this discipline. These are operations of periostomy, alveoloplasty, resection of the tooth root apex, vestibuloplasty, amputation of the tooth root and others. Residents are also required to participate in conferences and students seminars, symposiums, trainings, master classes. The educational process takes into account the individual characteristics of students, provides support for the implementation of the educational process and maintains a system for monitoring their achievements.

The implementation of the educational programme is allowed to provide sufficient material and technical base, personnel potential, active cooperation of the university with medical healthcare organizations. According to the standard, it is possible to note the compliance of the qualitative and quantitative composition of teachers for the implementation of the educational programme and the feedback of the heads of practical bases on the sufficient level of training of specialists. An analysis of the resident survey on the quality of classes showed that the respondents were completely (91.67%) and partially (8.33%) satisfied with the methods of teaching. There is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.) – 100% fully agree. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills – completely agree 91.67%, partially 8.33%. According to 91.67% of residents, teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in classes, and according to 8.33% - sometimes.

# 2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care

The professionalism of residents is achieved through an effective structure of the educational programme, which forms the entire set of competencies necessary for practical work. Due to the availability of clinical facilities for residents, they spend most of their study time in close contact with patients, medical records, including automated health care systems. Work with automated health systems of residents is trained by mentors. When conducting interviews with residents, the experts were convinced that the organization of training and labor is focused on patients. Clinical training is carried out in accredited multidisciplinary hospitals and dental clinics in Almaty.

On the clinical base, a mentor is assigned to the resident – a practitioner of health care who has the highest qualification category. Under the supervision of a mentor, residents are trained in practical skills and abilities in the diagnosis and treatment of various pathologies, as well as in maintaining medical records, communication skills with patients, their relatives, colleagues, junior and nursing

staff. Feedback from the mentor and the resident is mandatory, since daily interaction in the clinic involves an analysis of clinical thinking and an assessment of the resident's communication skills. For professional training, the University provided residents with clinical bases and resources corresponding to the elements of the programme, levels of education, practical skills complexity depending on the year of study.

Training of residents on clinical bases is carried out under the guidance of curators, who are appointed from among the faculty members who have the academic degree of doctor, candidate of medical sciences, as well as the highest or first qualification category. In addition to the supervisor, the resident is assigned a mentor – a physician of practical health care who has high qualifications. Fixing mentors on medical bases allows residents to work daily with modern equipment and medical equipment of clinics. Mentors take an active part in the training of young specialists, pass on to the young specialist, the accumulated experience of professional skills, and teach the most rational techniques and advanced methods of work.

Thus, the resident studying in this specialty is assigned to the mentors of the head of the maxillofacial department, Candidate of Medical Sciences Iskakov M.Sh., and Master of Medicine, lecturer of the Department of Surgical and Orthopedic Dentistry Sarsenov A.Zh.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially - 1, do not match - 0 Standard 2: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. Develop quantitative indicators of R&D (2.2.4)

# Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS Evidence of compliance:

# 3.1 Methods of evaluation

Assessment of educational achievements of students is an important element of activity in the educational process, which determines the level and quality of the resident's training, as well as the competencies that are possessed at the end of training. Principles, methods and practices of evaluation, consistent with the final learning outcomes and based on a competency-based approach, promote the involvement of residents in clinical practice, thereby providing integrated and interprofessional training. The assessment policy, as well as the forms, methods and criteria for assessment are determined by the responsible department. The department responsible for the implementation of the educational programme generally uses methods for assessing knowledge and practical skills in accordance with the stated results and level of training.

Assessment methods used by the university in the educational process of residents: interview, testing, self-assessment, assessment of colleagues, feedback, portfolio assessment, assessment of the implementation of the scenario of clinical simulation, assessment of the completion of written tasks (writing a medical history, operating protocol), assessment according to the checklist of duty, filling in medical documentation, performance of practical skills, quality of medical registration, feedback from medical staff or mentor, analysis of participation in webinars, master classes, seminars, etc.

Test tasks are compiled in the amount of 180-350 per discipline. The number of clinical situations for examination tickets of the department is determined independently.

The assessment of practical skills is carried out on clinical bases during the supervision of patients in specialized departments of inpatients or in outpatient and polyclinic institutions, as well as in the educational and clinical center. Monitoring and evaluation of academic achievements of residents is carried out in the form of current, midterm, intermediate and final control within the framework of the studied specialty. The number of all types of discipline control is reflected in the syllabuses. The openness of the system for evaluating the educational achievements of students of the

residency at the university is achieved by filling in an electronic journal in the Platonus system. The electronic journal reflects the results of assessments received by residents at practical classes, midterm control, exam.

Intermediate control in the mastery of the programme is reflected in the current exams in the disciplines and the transfer clinical exam in the form of an intermediate annual certification. The forms of conducting are determined by the decision of the Academic Committee.

The list of mandatory disciplines for the final control during the interim certification is regulated by the completed disciplines, which are reflected in the WEPl. The results of academic achievements of students are recorded in the electronic educational journal "Platonus", which automatically generates examination sheets. When assessing professional competencies, an assessment of the resident's work in the clinic is used - an assessment of 360, on duty, during independent work. The University uses additional methods of assessing residents, such as a portfolio, assessment of scientific activities.

The resident in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" during the entire period of training forms a portfolio that corresponds to the final goals of the programme and contains unified reliable and valid criteria for assessing the student's activities. The compliance of control and measuring tools with training methods and the specifics of the curriculum is monitored by the CEP, which includes experienced methodologists and expert testologists who regularly increase their competence in testology.

Examination of tasks in the test form for compliance with the technical specifications of the specialty is carried out by reviewers. Tasks in the test form are checked for compliance with the training requirements and the obtained competencies in accordance with the residency course. Most of the test tasks are based on clinical situations, which correspond to the level of understanding, application, synthesis, analysis and evaluation.

committee А test (https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14HwOLGx9TRQtLUs52VaCBZtcVaOj15FO.) works to validity reliability and evaluation ensure the of methods.https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14HwOLGx9TRQtLUs52VaCBZtcVaOjl5FO When interviewing a resident in the specialty 7R01144 - "surgical dentistry", a positive answer was received due to satisfaction with the assessment methods.

Thus, analyzing the data of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01144- "Surgical Dentistry", as well as the results of interviews of commission members with focus groups during a visit to the university, it can be noted that the policy and procedures for assessing students of the residency are carried out on the basis of approved regulatory documents in the field of education in the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as internal university documents: Academic policy, Regulations on conducting current control, interim and final certification of students in the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity" and orders ensuring the transparency, reliability and validity of methods for assessing students' knowledge.

# 3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training

The methods used to assess the competencies of students at the NGO "KazRosmeduniversity" are defined in syllabuses on disciplines that are discussed and approved at departmental meetings, CEP, AC, SC.

It has been established that assessment methods are comparable to teaching and learning methods and cover the assessment of all competencies of students both during practical classes and during examinations.

The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria of 11 standards: 11 in full. Standard 3: Implemented

# Standard 4: STUDENTS Evidence of compliance:

# **4.1 Admission and Selection Policy**

The policy and procedures for the admission of residents to the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" is aimed at the implementation of the mission and objectives of the educational programme and is carried out in accordance with the following existing policy and internal regulatory documents.

Terms and conditions of resident admission are detailed in the "Residence Admission Rules" for the relevant academic year (<u>https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14HwOLGx9TRQtLUs52VaCBZtcVaOj15FO</u>). The regulatory framework is also available on the university's website. This provision is revised depending on the changes in the existing legislative and legal documents regulating the policy of selection of students of the residency. The educational programme assumes a clinical focus of study and in-depth specialized training in the specialty 7R01144 – "surgical dentistry".

In the specialty "Surgical Dentistry" the first recruitment of residents was carried out in 2021. One person was accepted.

University resources, the teaching staff of departments, the number and material and technical equipment of clinical bases, the professionalism of practical health care staff (clinical mentors) allow to provide a balance and opportunities for training and recruitment of students.

In order to ensure transparency of the selection procedure and equality of access to training in the residency, the university carries out a number of measures:

- informing through the website of the university and social networks (Facebook, Instagram) about the beginning of admission of documents to the residency no later than 1 month before the start of the admission commission;
- posting information on the procedure and organization of the work of the appeal commission on the university's website;
- publication of the results of the entrance examinations and the list received on the university's website.

The University strictly observes the constitutional rights of citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan and foreign states - no one may be subjected to any discrimination on the grounds of origin, social, official and property status, sex, race, nationality, language, attitude to religion, beliefs, place of residence, physical handicaps in development or any other circumstances.

One of the main conditions for the education of people with disabilities is the creation of a barrierfree environment in the inclusive education system and the corresponding technical equipment. For this purpose, special equipment and devices are available to ensure access to classrooms and free movement within the territory of educational institutions and dormitories. These include elevators, railings, handrails, ramps, stair lifts, etc...

# 4.2 Number of residents

The number of accepted residents is carried out taking into account the possibilities of clinical, practical training, the maximum permissible load on mentors, the availability of educational, methodological and scientific literature, the capacity of clinical bases, as well as material and technical resources of the university. Admission of residency students is carried out by the admission commission. The number of accepted students is agreed with the relevant stakeholders, taking into account the need for practical health care and the labor market in graduates of implemented educational programmes. In accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the university has the right to carry out admission in excess of the state order on the basis of contracts

with tuition fees at the expense of individuals or legal entities. The accredited programme includes 1 resident for 1 year on a contractual basis.

# 4.3 Resident support and advice

The system of academic counseling of residents is carried out with the participation of a curator, a clinical mentor. On all issues of the organization of the educational process and the choice of elective disciplines, the counseling is carried out by the curator, the head of the clinical department and the department of postgraduate education. Prior to the beginning of each examination session, the department/course develops and approves the schedule for the consultation on the disciplines. Experienced teachers, associate professors, professors are involved in the consultation.

The university provides support to students of the residency, focused on social, financial and personal needs. The university has a department of social and psychological support, which provides assistance in cases of professional crisis, as well as other emergency situations among residents. The university provides for the transfer of residency students from one educational institution to another in the presence of vacant budget seats in accordance with the current policy and internal documents.

When transferring a student from a foreign educational institution, a document on the mastered curricula (academic certificate, transcript), as well as a document on the completion of the previous level of education, which must undergo the procedure of nostrification in the Republic of Kazakhstan in accordance with the established procedure, is presented.

Financial support consists in providing a monthly scholarship for residents studying under the grant, a dormitory for those in need, and material assistance. Funding of residents' trips to internships, conferences, forums, cultural events held outside the university is carried out at the expense of the funds provided for by the legislation and internal regulations of the university. Thus, the students of the residency have the opportunity to receive legal advice, psychological support from a regular teacher-psychologist. To this end, the resident is assigned a curator who provides the functions of an academic mentor, participates in the formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, manages the educational and scientific activities of the student, assists in employment and a clinical mentor in the medical organization where the resident is trained. Analysis of the questionnaire of residents about their support showed that teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - 100% fully agree. Fully (100%) satisfied with the library collection and resources. All 100% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources.

# 4.4 Representation of residents

Participation in the development and evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty "Surgical Dentistry" is carried out by residents through the provision of systematic feedback and representation in the CEP, AC, SC of the university.

Students of the residency have the opportunity to attend meetings of deliberative bodies, actively participate in the discussion of issues in the context of their specialty. Proposals and recommendations of students are necessarily taken into account by the members of the deliberative bodies and are taken into account when forming the final decision of the meeting.

# 4.5 Working conditions

According to the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020 "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to education and training of medical personnel in the residency", resident doctors studying under a state educational order are paid a scholarship.

Resident doctors are granted holidays between academic periods. The duration of holidays during the academic year is at least seven weeks, with the exception of the final year. The right to combine training with work (no more than 0.5 hours) in areas of activity close to his future specialty in his free time from study with the consent of the supervisor, the head of the department and the head of the residency department. When interviewing residents and graduates, it was found that during

meetings with employees of the department of postgraduate education and university management, students have the opportunity to express their opinions and wishes regarding their participation in the decision-making process, ensuring academic quality and other professional, financial and social issues. All issues raised and discussed at these meetings are addressed in a timely and appropriate manner.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 30 standards: full – 30. *Standard 4: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:* 

# Standard 5: FACULTY Evidence of compliance:

# **5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy**

The University conducts its policy of selection and admission of teaching staff, part-time workers and mentors in accordance with the mission of the university, which primarily provides for the experience, criteria of scientific, educational, pedagogical and clinical achievements necessary to maintain a balance in meeting the requirements for the preparation of residents. The University has developed and successfully operates a Personnel Policy, which reflects: the selection and admission of employees, the development and activities of employees, the promotion of employees, etc. The requirements for staffing of the educational process are determined by the qualification requirements for educational activities. In accordance with the SCES, a mentor is appointed for clinical training in the residency in the specialties from among qualified practitioners of health care working on the bases of the residency, having the first or higher qualification category, with a requirement for seniority in the relevant specialty of at least 5 years. Analysis of the quantitative and qualitative composition of the teaching staff, monitoring and evaluation of pedagogical activities are the objects of constant attention on the part of the University management. The total number of faculty of residents and teachers is 3:1. The faculty, which implements the EP of the residency of the specialty 7R01144 -"surgical dentistry", is the Department of Surgical and Orthopedic Dentistry, in the amount of 3 people: Candidate of Medical Sciences- 2 and 1 mentor per 1 resident. All teachers are in the highest and first category.

# **5.2 Teachers' obligations and development**

The main role in the training of residents in the specialty 7R01144 – "Surgical Dentistry", is assigned to the faculty, whose duties include: to have a full understanding of the requirements of the SCES and the standard curricula of the specialty; to have a full understanding of the requirements for the level of training of the graduate in the composition of knowledge, skills and abilities in the specialty or the discipline provided; to participate in the development of the educational programme of the residency, to participate in the formation of a contingent of students of the residency in the specialized specialty, to agree on the content of the curricula; to ensure a high level of teaching of disciplines through the application of traditional and the introduction of innovative technologies and interactive teaching methods.

When meeting with the university's teaching staff, it was found that the University has introduced a policy for the activities and development of teaching staff, which guarantees recognition of academic activities, with an appropriate focus on pedagogical, research and clinical qualifications, which is carried out in the form of awards, promotions and/or remuneration. The programme of professional development, implemented through retraining and advanced training, is carried out at the request of the heads of departments in accordance with the advanced training plan, every 5 years for pedagogical competencies and every 5 years for professional competencies. Thus, each employee of the department takes a full training in the programme every five years, with a total duration of at least 216 hours. For employees who wish to undergo on-the-job training, the training is carried out in the

amount of 27 hours per week, or according to a specially established schedule. The participation of teachers in advanced training programmes is reflected in individual reports and plans of teaching staff, monitored by intradepartmental control. Upon completion of advanced training, reports or documents confirming the training (certificates) are provided.

The University also maintains and develops the system of intangible remuneration, including all forms of recognition of merit of the award, types of surcharges are provided for the TS. According to the results of the survey of faculty during the work of the EEC, 100% are satisfied with the organization of the educational process. The university observes ethics and subordination completely agree 100%. Completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace 92.86% of respondents, partially - 7.14%. There is an opportunity for career growth and competence development for teachers in the organization - 100% fully agree. In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of research -100% completely agree.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 7 standards: full – 7. *Standard 5:* Implemented *Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:* 

# Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES Evidence of compliance:

# 6.1 Logistics and equipment

The NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" provides all the necessary resources for the organization of the learning process. The material and technical base of the University for the implementation of the programme 7R01144 - "surgical dentistry" has opportunities for practical and theoretical training, there is access to the latest professional literature and sources, information technologies and equipment. The educational premises, where the educational process of the accredited programme is implemented, are located on the streets of Torekulov 71 and Abylai Khan 51, are equipped with personal computers, multimedia installations and office equipment. The selfassessment report indicates that the University administration allocates the necessary funds to improve the material and technical base, taking into account the needs of the departments, university-wide applications for the purchase of educational material and medical equipment are formed. This makes it possible to ensure that the educational process is conducted in accordance with educational standards. Analysis of the resident survey showed the following data on satisfaction with material and technical support: according to 100% (fully) office equipment is available for use on the basis of practice. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - fully agree 100%. Fully (100%) satisfied with the library collection and resources. All 100% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources. The organization of clinical training, according to 75% of respondents, fully satisfies them, but 25% - partially.

# **6.2 Clinical Bases**

The provision of an appropriate educational environment for clinical training is carried out in the educational and clinical center (CC) and in the clinical bases of the university. The UCC is equipped with modern dental units, dummies and simulators in accordance with the topics of the clinical training programme. Clinical bases for training have a sufficient number of patients with a variety of dental nosologies and equipment to master the practical skills provided by the training programme. Completeness of training is provided by the possibility of training also in specialized clinics of national importance as the Military Dental Polyclinic of the Ministry of Defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The equipment of clinical bases contributes to the high-quality organization of the educational process and the provision of specialized and highly specialized inpatient and outpatient polyclinic assistance to the population. To implement the educational programme, clinical agreements

were concluded between the University and the basic clinics: VIP-IT LLP, Dostar Med LLP, Dara Dent LLP, Nurzhamal Dentistry LLP, Eurodent LLP, Atlasdentalclinic Clinic, City Clinical Hospital No.5, Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital, etc.

#### **6.3 Information technology**

Information and communication technologies, including Internet resources, international databases of scientific and educational literature, electronic textbooks are actively used in the implementation of the educational programme on residency. Thus, the volume of the book and magazine fund as of January 5, 2021 in the specialty "dentistry" is 8,1023 copies, of which 61,809 copies are educational, including 44,680 in the state language, in English. - 3276; educational-methodical, scientific literature - 19214 copies, including state. 9661 copies, in English -655 copies.

In recent years, the following textbooks have been purchased for the dental residency: for the discipline "Local anesthesia for oral surgery" - Periodontal anesthesia. Modern technologies: management / S. A. Rabinovich, Yu. L. Vasiliev, T. D. Babich, I. A. Zinoviev. - Moscow: GEOTAR-Media, 2019., for the discipline "Purulent surgery of the oral cavity"- Gostishchev V.K. Clinical operative purulent surgery: a guide for doctors. - Moscow, for the discipline "Restorative Oral Surgery"- Surgical Dentistry: Textbook / V. V. Afanasiev [et al.]. - 3rd ed., rev. - Moscow: GEOTAR-Media, 2019, for the discipline "Dental Implantation" - Dental Implantation: National Guide / edited by A. A. Kulakova. — Moscow: GEOTAR-Media, 2018, as well as others. (<u>Google Docs</u>). To improve the work of the library, the university purchased an automated library information system "Irbis-64". The programme has modules "Registration", "Catalogue", "Picking", "Book issue", "Web-catalogue". On the university's website, under the heading "Library", students and faculty have access to an electronic catalogue. On the basis of the Copyright Agreements, a repository of works of the teaching staff of KRMU was created on the university 's website. In addition, there is a help desk "Ask the librarian", where students have the opportunity to ask a question of interest to them. Thus, library specialists perform factual, bibliographic references.

Cooperation agreements have been signed with RIEB for 2022, with JSC "KRIOR", LLP "Kazakh Medical University " KSPH ", RLBVIC, LLC "Institute of Healthcare Management Problems ", with KazNU named after Al-Farabi, KBTU, KRMC, etc. There are more than 20 contracts in total. Each year, the Library organizes access to several databases on the basis of License Agreements.

The university has a test center for 122 seats, 3 computer rooms for 39 seats, a linguistic office for 15 seats, an electronic library hall for 22 seats.

There is a software and hardware base, computer equipment connected by a single corporate wired and wireless local area network with Internet access. The connection of computers to the Internet is 100%, and all clinical bases have telephone lines with unlimited Internet access. Access to all information systems was demonstrated by EEC. For independent work of students and teachers, access to the electronic medical library "Doctor's Consultant" is organized. The eLibrary contains clinical and national guidelines, drug directories, standards of care, and other information needed by physicians. At the university, information support for the work of residents is carried out through: the media (Facebook, Telegramm, etc.) university website; television monitors in the lobby of educational buildings; boards of official information of the Residence Department and university departments. **6.4 Clinical Teams** 

The skills of coordination of work with colleagues and other health care specialists, residents in the specialty 7R01144 – Surgical Dentistry" develop during examination, treatment and emergency care of patients in clinics. The resident is present during the consultations, fulfills the orders of senior colleagues within his competence. The result of the resident's activity is checked by the teacher and reflected in the diary-report.

# 6.5 Medical Research and Advances

The main applied scientific direction of the university is the development of innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural

population. Thus, an initiative research was carried out on the topic: "Improving the provision of medical care to residents of rural regions at the level of primary health care through mobile mobile complexes". The research work of the department is regulated by the research work plan. The priority areas of research of the department employees are theoretical and practical issues of diagnosis and treatment of oral diseases, which are reflected in the acts of implementation of the 2021-2022 academic year "Case-Based Training (CBL) "Surgery with an atypically located tooth on the lower jaw"; "Orthopaedic treatment with complete absence of teeth (complete edentulism)".

Despite the achievements, interviews with faculty indicated that there was a need for greater support from the University administration in the conduct of medical education research by faculty. The participation of residents and teaching staff in research projects should be increased, with the publication of the results in peer-reviewed databases (Scopus, Web of science), as well as the introduction of the results of scientific research into the educational process.

# 6.6 Education expertise

The development of expertise in the assessment of education and research in the discipline of medical education is ensured through the joint work of departments, department of academic work, CEP and AC.

Duties of examination in the assessment of education and research in the discipline of medical education are assigned to the department of academic work.

In order to improve the quality of medical education and to develop and improve the pedagogical and professional competencies of teachers and medical workers, a school for teachers has been set up. **6.7 Training in other institutions** 

The University implements the "Academic Mobility of Students" programmes in accordance with the principles of the Bologna process and in accordance with the goals and needs of students and employees in compliance with ethical principles. The implementation of these programmes contributes to the internationalization of education and integration into the world educational space and is in accordance with the Strategic Plan of the University.

During the current period, opportunities for academic mobility were limited due to the involvement of resident doctors in the work of pharmacy hospitals. According to the accredited educational programme, recruitment was made in the 2021-2022 academic year, academic mobility is not provided for the first year of study.

In the further implementation of the educational programme, it is necessary to provide conditions for the implementation of academic mobility of residents and teachers in order to exchange experience and study international best practices.

Thus, the material and technical support of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01144 –"Surgical Dentistry" meets the requirements of the State Standard of the RoK, the needs of students and teaching staff, which allows to ensure the fulfillment of the purpose and purpose of the educational programme. EEC experts state that within the framework of the standard "Educational Resources", during the work of the expert commission and the analysis of the submitted documentation, compliance with the requirements of the standard was revealed.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with* 21 standards: fully -19, partially - 2.

# Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1. It is recommended that the individual plans of residents reflect the topic of research, publications, etc. (6.5.4.).
- 2. Develop a system to motivate health education research staff (6.6.3)

# Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION Evidence of compliance:

# 7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

The University has a multi-level system of evaluation of educational programmes, which includes ongoing monitoring by the Residency Department, as well as periodic monitoring by the Department of Academic Affairs. Learning achievements are systematically analyzed in relation to the mission and final learning outcomes of the educational programme. The University establishes and applies mechanisms for assessing the progress of students, including the monitoring of performance based on the results of sessions and monitoring the results of the state final exam, reports on the results of interim certification. Independent monitoring of data on the implementation and achievement of the final learning outcomes (LO) is carried out by independent certification of graduates of EP through the National Center for Independent Examinations (NCIE) and on employer questionnaires.

The identified shortcomings and problems are used as feedback for the implementation of measures and corrective action plans to improve the educational programme. Stakeholders (faculty, students, graduates, employers) are also involved in the evaluation of the educational programme. The results of monitoring are heard at the Academic Council of the University and the Academic Council, on the basis of which preventive and corrective measures are developed.

According to 75% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism for improving educational programmes, but 16.67% believe that it is not necessary to conduct and 8.33% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive -91.67% of residents, satisfactory -8.33%.

# 7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

The Department of Academic Work conducts a survey of teachers and students on the assessment of all components of the educational programme (perception of the programme, mastering the programme and achieving learning objectives). The assessment of the perception of the educational programme is analyzed based on the results of a survey of students by years of study, regarding their impressions of the content of the educational programme and the learning process as a whole. The questionnaire includes a list of questions concerning the quality of the educational process and the educational programme: the quality of syllabuses; the quality of training in specialized disciplines; the effectiveness of the teaching and learning methods used at the university; the quality of mastered competencies; the objectivity of the methods used in the university to assess knowledge and skills; the compliance of the CMS disciplines when conducting intermediate and final controls; the quality of the schedule of classes; the organization of IWS, advisory assistance; problems of the educational process.

Questionnaire questions are periodically updated and updated. In the process of monitoring, on the basis of the obtained data, the educational programme is adjusted taking into account the main priority directions in education by the responsible structural units for their implementation. Additionally, the placement of boxes for complaints and suggestions in educational and laboratory buildings is used.

The feedback results are analyzed and discussed at the meetings of the departments, the CEP, and the Academic Council. They are taken into account when planning work for improvement. In general, the use of feedback contributes to a better understanding of the current needs of students and teachers and is systematic when making changes to the educational programme. Students' participation in the evaluation of educational programmes is carried out through feedback from teachers, curators, at meetings of students with heads of departments, deans, vice-rectors. Students of the university have the opportunity to address their questions to the management of the university through the rector's blog and social networks of the university. Appeals of students are analyzed and taken into account in further work to improve the activities of the university.

# 7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates

There was no graduation under the accredited educational programme.

#### 7.4 Stakeholder Engagement

The university analyzes the results of training of residents on the basis of reviews and opinions of employers, according to which the level of qualification of trained specialists is assessed. To study the opinion of interested parties (consumers), activities are carried out: career guidance among school leavers, questioning and interviewing with applicants, questioning students, employers, teaching staff, university graduates. Based on the analysis of the activities carried out, measures are formed to improve activities and meet needs, as a result of which the goals and objectives are updated, as well as the mission of the university. Taking into account the opinions of the representatives of practical health care, who are members of the academic committee and the academic council, as well as according to the trajectory of study in the specialty, a catalog of elective disciplines is annually formed and approved. The number of hours of the elective component (elective disciplines), their correlation with the mandatory disciplines are regulated by the SCES RoK.

# 7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes

The examination of the educational programme is carried out by the committee of educational programmes (CEP). The CEP approves the catalog of elective disciplines, taking into account preand post-requisites, evaluates the choice of methods for assessing the results of training of residents. The CEP carries out a systematic study and comprehensive assessment of EP in order to improve and guarantee quality (determining the value of the programme, achieving the goal, achieving tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of the training methodology), as well as an assessment of the educational and methodological support and support of the educational process.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15. Standard 7: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

# Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION Evidence of compliance:

# 8.1 Management

The University has a management system that contributes to the achievement of the mission and objectives, maintains institutional efficiency and integrity, creates and maintains an environment for learning and conducting research and creative activities. In accordance with the normative legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan, for the implementation of the mission and the strategic plan of the university, the Regulations on structural units were developed and approved, which determine the main directions of their activities, requirements for the administrative and legal assignment of its status to the structural unit in the organizational structure of the university management, a list of regulatory documents; job descriptions of employees, which determine the procedure for their appointment and dismissal from office, rights, duties, powers.

The University is guided in its activities by: Standard Rules for the Activities of Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher and (or) Postgraduate Education (Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 595 dated 30.10.2018); Labor Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan; Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Public Health and the Health Care System"; Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education"; Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On State Property"; Charter of the University; Regulations and directive documents of the authorized body and local self-government bodies.

Periodic evaluation of the university management is carried out at the meetings of the collegial advisory bodies by conducting an internal audit and self-assessment. One of the important strategic directions of the University is to improve the efficiency of the management system, which is determined in order to ensure the effective functioning of quality management. One of the documents underlying the management review of the quality management system is the management review.

28

# 8.2 Academic Leadership

The management of the university constantly analyzes the implementation of the mission in relation to the implementation of residency programmes, on the basis of this analysis, carries out management decisions and reorganizes structures to optimize its activities. The main structural units of the university are deans, departments, centers, departments, departments, laboratories, etc., which perform certain functional duties. There are connections between the divisions, which can be horizontal and vertical. Direct management of resident programmes and coordination of resident activities since the existence of the resident programme is carried out by the Resident Department. The main purpose of the department is to carry out continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the mission and purpose of educational programmes, including residency in the accredited specialty. The department reports directly to the vice-rector for scientific and clinical activities and the rector.

# 8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The University independently carries out financial and economic activities, its financial autonomy correlates with the principles of responsibility to society for the quality of all professional training activities within the framework of the educational programme "Surgical Dentistry", scientific research and the provision of services, with the effective management of funds and state property.

The budget of KazRosmeduniversity is formed from two sources: the republican budget (state order for training of personnel of higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and provision of paid educational services. Within the framework of financial autonomy, it is possible to independently solve the issues of increasing the revenue side of the budget, thereby providing additional financing for the development of intangible assets. At the same time, the connection with the state is maintained: the university carries out a state order for the training of highly qualified specialists and implements scientific projects within the framework of state programmes.

# 8.4 Administration and Management

When interviewing the AMP and teachers, the members of the EEC noted that the University clearly defined the responsibility of academic management in relation to the development and management of the educational programme. During an online conversation with focus groups, a response was received from interviewers that the University periodically assesses academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and final learning outcomes. Administration and management are implemented in accordance with international standards, regularly updated by internal regulations in the field of health and education, which ensures the improvement of competence and the achievement of final learning outcomes in the residency.

# **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

It was established that the constructive dialogue of the university with the Ministry of Education and Science and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the organization of the educational process in the residency is carried out through the implementation of the State Standard on Education 2020 and is consistent with the priority areas of the following national legislative and programme documents.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15. *Standard 8: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:* none

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL Evidence of compliance: In the process of implementing educational activities, the University systematically initiates a procedure for regular review and updating of the processes, structure, content, learning outcomes/competencies, assessment of knowledge and skills, learning environment of the programme, allocates resources for continuous improvement. The strategy for the development of the educational programme "Surgical Dentistry" provides for the constant analysis and assessment of the quality system of educational and medical activities through systematic analysis of QMS, monitoring of feedback to consumers of services to determine the degree of their satisfaction with consumers and modernization of the communication system at the university. All areas of activity of the university are regulated by corporate documents (Procedures, Regulations, Instructions, Rules, Standard Operating Procedures, Methodological Recommendations, etc.).

The University's policy in the field of quality is aimed at ensuring the competitiveness of the university in the market of educational services, orientation to the introduction of innovative methods and technologies in the training of medical professionals, the provision of high-tech medical services and is maintained to meet the established requirements, constantly improved and adapted, periodically supplemented in accordance with the ongoing state reforms in the field of health and education, policy documents of the country.

Based on the analysis of the documented review, resources are allocated at all levels and an action plan is determined to update the postgraduate educational process, improve management.

The university has initiated procedures for regular review, updating the structure and function of the residency's educational programmes. The updating process is based on the results of prospective studies, analysis of the results, own experience of studying the literature on medical postgraduate education.

The university conducts continuous improvement of the quality of the educational process in the residency through revision and adaptation:

- educational technologies;
- Innovative educational environment;
- qualifications of faculty;

- the continuity of the process of training and professional self-development of health professionals, adapted and competitive in the Kazakhstan and international labor markets.

The university operates a QMS in order to monitor and obtain qualitative results in the training of specialists, constantly modified the competencies of the graduate of the residency in all specialties. To ensure the training of specialists, modern teaching technologies have been introduced into the educational process, interdisciplinary approaches have been introduced in the development of disciplines and principles of evidence-based medicine. Simulation technologies have been introduced into the educational process to develop and improve clinical skills. Thus, the competence approach practiced at the university in the system of training specialists, makes it possible to meet the needs of students and employers by managing the educational goals of educational programmes in the training of specialists.

The assessment of the knowledge of residents is assessed using test tasks of various levels of difficulty, a written exam. Assessment of the quality of the educational programme is assessed by a survey of employers. The results of the questionnaire survey are further analysed and discussed at various levels.

The University is continuously upgrading its resources to meet the needs of the University and the needs of employers. The University develops the potential of faculty, the policy of selection and admission of faculty to the University is conducted on the basis of strict compliance with regulatory requirements and respect for the interests of all parties. The university attracts highly qualified specialists of medical science and practical health care for the training of residents. In the future, the teaching staff continues continuing education in clinical speciality and pedagogy. The equipment is constantly updated at the clinical bases and the clinical bases are equipped with modern equipment. An example of the process of continuous improvement, approaches to the implementation of the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" is the active participation of stakeholders (primarily representatives of employers) in the formation of an educational strategy that reflects the social responsibility of the university for the development of advanced innovative technologies in medical practice and science, the use of advances in information and communication technologies, as well as the improvement of public health.

The members of the EEC, having analyzed the submitted documents, the results of the survey of faculty and teachers and having interviewed the participants of the focus groups, came to the conclusion that the University, as a dynamic and socially responsible institution, initiates procedures for regular review and revision of the content, results /competencies, assessment and learning environment.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 4 standards: fully - 4. *Standard 9:* Implemented *Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit*: none

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and conducting an examination within the framework of the implementation of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme have been found.

# 6. Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01144 – Surgical dentistry:

- 1. Develop quantitative indicators of R&D (2.2.4)
- 2. It is recommended that the individual plans of residents reflect the topic of research, publications, etc. (6.5.4.).
- 3. Develop a system to motivate health education research staff (6.6.3)

# 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01144 – "Surgical Dentistry" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit

Председатель Внешней экспертной комиссии	
Зарубежный эксперт	
Национальный академический эксперт	
Национальный академический эксперт	
Национальный академический эксперт	
Национальный академический эксперт	
Национальный академический эксперт	
Национальный академический эксперт	
Эксперт – представитель работодателей	
Эксперт – представитель резидентов	

Курманова Алмагуль Медеубаевна

Закирова Гузель Закировна

Кауышева Алмагуль Амангельдиновна

Сарсенбаева Гульжан Искендировна

Бачева Ирина Викторовна

Уразова Салтанат Нургожаевна

Ларюшина Елена Михайловна

Султанова Гулнар Достановна

Нургалиев Нурлан Ермекбаевич

Майкенова Арайлым Мураткызы

-75 M

32

Attachment 1.

# Quality profile and criteria of external evaluation and educational programme 7R01144 -"Surgical Dentistry" (generalization)

			Estimation		
Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	17	-	<b>F</b> -1
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	30	17 29	1	
3	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	11		
4	STUDENTS	30	30		
5	FACULTY	7	7		
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	19	2	
7	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15	_	
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15		
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4		
	Subtotal:	150	147	3	
				150	